

A

The first thing, in order to be noticed in the letter of my colleagues is their assertion, "that for some time past they have suffered ~~an~~ embarrassment in their management of the interests of the medical ~~in~~ Institution of Harvard University; which embarrassments have arisen from a want of confidence on our part in the Professor of the Theory & Practice of Physic; and we have not believed it altogether safe, say they, to engage in any free discussion respecting the affairs of the Institution with that Professor."

I am not conscious of having impeded, or any way embarrassed, any of the proceedings of the Medical School; on the contrary I am certain that I have ever promoted its interest to the injury of my own; and I have never lost sight of the great & predominant interest & advantage of the collected body, or assemblage of youth in that ^{great} School at Cambridge: for example, I early gave my opinion against suffering the Juniors to attend our medical courses. I saw & lamented the derangement that it occasioned throughout the two succeeding years of their college life. I was moreover of opinion that some of our lectures were injurious to the minds of these boys; & that they had a bad effect on their ^{moral} imaginations; inso- much that I would not allow a son of mine, at 17 years of age to attend some of our medical lectures. This feeling as it re- garded the minds of my own children I extended to the Chib-

children of others. It was, therefore, owing to me principally, that youth of the Junior Class were prohibited from attending any of the Medical Lectures. This was sacrificing interest to a sentiment, where the morality of the youth predominated over mere personal advantage, or professional views. I knew that this was not pleasing to every one of my brethren; but such was the fact, & such my motives, which may be concentrated in these words — I regarded the minds & imaginations of the children of other people as I did the minds of my own. — To all this I may add that my general opinion was, that a young man had better postpone attendance on Medical Lectures till after he had finished his 4 years collegiate course. [See the Lecture Decr. 1810]

They have said that "they believed it not altogether safe to engage in discussion" with me. It certainly was not altogether safe, if the discussion contained any thing of a dishonorable cast, such as that which took place last Spring just before our Lectures commenced in Cambridge. The Students were told that in consequence of the removal of the medical Lectures to Boston, a course of each would be delivered in Cambridge to those of a certain standing free of all expense. And this was announced to them by the Rev^d. Dr. Ware in the Chapel and repeated to me whenever the Students applied to me

for information relative to our new arrangement of things. I told them that all our medical Lectures would be given to them gratis ously, and they had already been informed that two of the three Professors had had their salaries raised in consequence of this arrangement. But when it was told in College that the anatomical Lectures would be of little or no consequence without the dissections of a corps, or in a word not worth their attendance, but that for 15 dollars they would be made worth their attention, an uneasiness was created, & there was a pretty general determination not to attend them on those conditions. The young men declared that they had been promised from the Presiding officer, that these lectures should be for them free of expense, & some of them called on me to enquire if they had misunderstood me. I repeated what I had said to them, and it is not improbable that they may have discovered in me a surprise to obtain the fifteen dollars from them. It became a subject of much conversation. The Rev. Dr. Ware expressed to me his surprise & mortification at this demand on the Students, after what he had officially announced to them in the Chapel, & asked me for an explanation of it, which I was unable to give him. In this situation of things I wrote to the President & expressed my sentiments with the same freedom that other gentlemen of the College did in their conversation. I well remember that Mr. Gannett's opinion entirely coincided

with mine respecting the injury it would be to our Medical Institution. — Not long after the Students were induced to believe that the Rev^d. Dr. Holmes & myself were formenters of the discontent, that for a short time prevailed among the Students. The Corporation can obtain information on this subject by enquiring of some of the elder officers of the College. They will find that we were all concerned at that time for the honour of the Medical Department. Yet the blame was endeavoured to be thrown on the Rev^d. Dr. Holmes, for some things advanced in the Board of overseers, & upon myself. This therefore was an instance of an attempt to embarrass our Medical Institution, when, in truth it was an attempt to preserve it from the effects of some very hard accusations, uttered against us.

Another instance of embarrassment & danger of free discussion, was in the affair of the Hospital for the insane, which has excited the highest degree of resentment, & given a "vis et acumen" to every other accusation. I mention this business of the Insane Hospital, not merely from prevalent reports, but because President Kirkland has, since we met last here, accused me of being the author, or rather the adviser of the Governor to destroy the arrangement made for carrying it into effect. He spoke I apprehend the sentiments of these Professors, when he said "you are answerable for the deprivation of the comfort, the care, & the relief of ^{which} hundreds of afflicted men & women"

BMS 1011

would have reaped had this institution been allowed to go on.
He repeated it, that what the Governor had done, I had advised
him to. I at once perceived, upon taking all that he said into view,
that he spoke the feelings of my accusers. And I have been
persuaded from the beginning, that this Lunatic-hospital-affair
was in the minds of my accusers, when they put together the first
paragraph of their extraordinary letter. Presuming that my sup-
posed conduct respecting the contemplated hospital had a powerful
effect in producing this letter of the Medical Professors, I thought
I was justified in relating what the President said of me to the
Governor - To which he replied - Tell the President from me
that I should have made precisely the same remarks respecting
the bye laws of the General Hospital, had you never existed, for
they were entirely the result of my own view of the subject on
my first reading them."

N. B. I said nothing about party views & purposes, as ^{the} Pres^t must have
uttered those words in haste.

An Asylum for the insane had long been an object of my
attention. It was a leading object of a visit to Philadelphia
3 years ago, & I have from time to time, kept the idea alive
in the News papers. I have had as much acquaintance with
Hospitals as any man who hears me speak, & more too, &
have paid no small attention to the subject of asylums for

the insane. It is my hearts desire and most earnest wish to see an Hospital or Asylum for those bereaft of the due exercise of reason, established in Massachusetts; but not in the town in Boston, nor situated near to a common hospital, so as to associate in our ideas one with the other; and moreover (which I suppose has given unpardonable offence) I hope never to see this establishment made subservient to our Medical School. I hope never to see a train of pupils visiting it. In a word I hope to see it entirely disconnected with our Medical Schools. I hope we shall correct the fault of the Pennsylvania Hospital, where the screaming of the maniacs are within ^{the} hearing of patients in a fever.

— I was grieved when I found that there were steps taking to mar as I conceived, the beauty of the design. On comparing my experience & means of information with that of others here among us, I thought that my opinions had as solid a foundation as theirs. I have uttered these opinions with decency, and have been answered ~~by~~ personal abuse.

If my colleagues ever wished for my opinion on any of these matters, why not communicate with me freely, frankly & in a friendly manner? ~~This they never have done!~~ This they never have done in any one instance. One of them called on me to communicate the new order of things respecting the removal to Boston, and, as was pretended every thing else connected with it; but took ^{only} care to lift up one corner of the veil,

while all the rest was concealed, and then accused me of duplicity, because I did not give my entire & unqualified approbation of what I could not (for want of all the information) clearly understand.

If there be therefore any instance in which I have embarrassed the affairs of our Medical School, let it now be mentioned.

[Faint, illegible handwriting, likely bleed-through from the reverse side of the page.]

BMS 2 10.1

Respecting the 1st charge, viz - that I have been engaged in the support of plans inimical to the interests of the Medical Institution, I pronounce it to be an untruth, or a mistake; & wish my accusers to mention the instance.

All my efforts, which have not been so very zealous as has been reported, have been for the establishment of a New Medical Society, which should conduct itself with more industry & less ^{al}particularity than the old one.

I gave my attendance to the Mass. Med. Society for a number of years, and found, that instead of employing itself in improving physick, in making & diffusing ^{varies} discourses & experiments, our time was almost wholly taken up in quarreling; & the object of their quarrel was for a series of years our Medical School at Cambridge. I often mentioned to some of the members, that the Med. Society did by no means answer the intention of its creation. I knew what Medical Societies were in Great Britain. I had been Secretary to the old, now Royal Med. Society of Edinburgh, from about a month after I first arrived there until I left it, and had from my office in it an opportunity of knowing its private economy & all its public doings. I was pretty well acquainted with Medical Societies in London, & when I compared these

British Medical Societies with the one to which I belonged here I felt humiliated at the comparison. Such was the conduct of the Mass. Med. Society towards us three Professors, that we all concluded, at one period, to retire from it. They may remember that period, when I remind them of the argument I made use of to induce one of them to remain in it. I told them that one ~~of them~~ had better remain in the Society, like a missionary among the Indians, who would be able to discover & report any mischief that was brewing against us. — What they did I do not recollect; but I did not visit the Society for several years; and heard nothing of their doings unless it was of a violent dispute & quarrel between Dr. Lloyd and Dr. Spring.

I do not recollect having any other communication with the Mass. Med. Society until the year 1801. At that time I learnt that the Med. Society had sent to London, & had bought a guinea's worth of vaccine matter at the London Vaccine Institution; but that on trial it had proved to have lost its efficacy. I thereupon sent them a portion of my own, that I had just received from England, and some quite fresh; and in the letter which accompanied it, I told the Society through its President, that I was dissatisfied with the modes of distributing the matter & the manner of diffusing its benefits. I felt disposed to take their advice, & go by their directions. —

Their conduct on this occasion is now publishing, and the public can form their own judgment of their behaviour & of mine. When I found my communications flighted, & my papers contemptuously returned, and myself treated with no more attention than if I was an horse farrier, I determined to retire forever from the Society. I however preserved a profound silence as it regarded the Society. And I should not now have brought the affair before the public, had not the officers of it, as I believe, republished their calumnies in a scurrilous Pamphlet, which it is probable all of you have seen —

These things are related to shew how little fit this Society is to lead & direct the Medical affairs of our Commonwealth of Physic. My publications are to shew that my retiring from the Med. Society was not the result of whim, but of principle; and to point out the defects of it, in order to shew the necessity of forming another. This has not been an entirely new idea; the fathers of the Profession have long spoken of it, and lamented that their labours was not another central point to which the observations, experiments & discoveries of ingenious, modest & unpatronized physicians might be directed, & thence reflected back to every part of the Commonwealth. Our oldest & most distinguished Physicians in Boston & in the Country have given their opinion that such a new Society would be beneficial; but none of them have felt a disposition to disturb Our Medical School of Harvard University.

If they have designs of that sort, they keep it from me.

That I have been engaged in plans injurious to the Medical School, of which I am one of ~~its~~ ^{its} Professors, & to which I have been closely allied for 30 years is an incredible thing. It is contrary to all our experience, & is opposed to the common feelings of the human heart.?

I have all along supposed that this accusation brought against me by my colleagues was a mere artifice, & that they themselves did not believe a word of it. I never contemplated a College of Physicians to give degrees, and to come forth arranged against our own Medical School; & I repeat it as my fixed opinion that the Professors here present did not believe it themselves.

I consider it a mere manoeuvre to engage this Corporation on the side of the Medical Society. The conduct of these gentlemen gives strength to this opinion. They have sent circular letters to every physician of any note in the State & more too; & to them has been held up the Medical Society only, as being like to be injured. Not a word is uttered to them of the Medical School of Harvard College. They hear nothing but of the poor distressed Medical Society. Some clergymen in the country have been told, that the College of Physicians was to destroy the Hospital for the insane & to root up other establishments equally benevolent. But ^{to} the Corporation, & the Overseers these gentlemen say not a word of the Medical Society; that is thrust out of sight, & left far in the back ground; & the Medical School of Harvard College

Rev. J. B. Marblehead

MS. A. 10. 1

Two points have been long aimed at by my accusers. The first is by conducting in such an offensive manner towards me, as to excite resentment, and then to make use of any expression of resentment as an argument for a nonintercourse with me; which nonintercourse is a darling point which they wish the Corporation to sanction. -

Several of the pupils have been dissuaded from attending my lectures; and have been taught to believe that they could obtain a Medical degree without attendance on my course; and when this appeared to some dubious, they have been advised to come to me and buy an admission ticket, which ticket would be used as a ^{when presented} voucher to your next commencement. Or else it was an insidious attempt to entice me from the strict line of propriety, and to be made the foundation of some future charge. (See Geo. Bates's billet) - About ten days since a pupil, a young man from the country, was circulating a paper for subscribers addressed to this Hon. and Reverend body, setting forth that the lectures on the Theory & Practice of Physic were not worth attending, that the Prof. taught nothing but old and obsolete doctrines, of no value or service to them, and speaking of me in terms of disrespect, and begging of the Corporation so to modify the institution that they might obtain a Medical degree without attendance on my course of lectures, or after attending one course only &c. (See also remark 6 page 12 of an anonymous pamphlet the author is identified by the letter page 5).

I know not how this sort of conduct strikes the Corpor-

Corporation collectively, but it seems to me that every settled minister, as well as every Professor may be seriously affected if such a line of conduct be countenanced by any of us; or rather if it be not denounced by us all.

The second grand object which my accusers had in view was to shake my character for veracity, and to induce you to confirm the infamy. This would be a great point gained, because Dr Warren has been informed from me directly and indirectly that I meant to lay the treatment I had received experienced from him, and some under his influence before the public. —

By impeaching my veracity he hoped to blunt the edge of this instrument. This is an infamous charge which I hope may be patiently sifted, and searched to the bottom. This charge is of so serious a nature, that I hope it may not be peeped slightly over. As this charge relates to character, I hope the Rev. Dr Lathrop who has known me longest, and most intimately of any of the Corporation, will be present when I come to speak particularly upon it; and this is an additional, and weighty reason for wishing that my Defence may be postponed till he is able to attend it.

I have found out that it was the plan of these Gentlemen to stow me away in Cambridge as an Emeritus Professor, and they were contented that I should have my salary on condition that I should give my lectureship to another. They found however that I was not willing, nor the public interested.

They then proposed transferring the Lectures to Boston, and I agreed to it; and to convince them that I was in

earnest, I assured them that I would remove my family to Boston. I soon found that this step was not agreeable to their previous arrangements, and deeply concerted plans. Dr Warren therefore adopted an abominable plan, yes! a diabolical one, to separate me from the rest of the Professors, & that was to commence a quarrel with me, & so to effect the separation he contemplated, the ultimate design of which was to place all three of the professorships in the hands of three young men; of which three, two were his sons. To this end I was invited to a conference at his house, where I was treated with gross abuse, and my conversation written down by one of his sons after my departure, & then applied to a subject different from what really was the fact.

Since then I have ^{been} the subject of their calumnies. They have said that "I am in a state of open hostility with this Corporation." (Dr Warren's own words) and that I had quarreled with Judge Davis, and other assertions equally groundless; and to crown all they have made 3 charges against me in writing to the Corporation; and I hope to be able to show that all three of them are false and malicious. — —

BMS C 10.1

Dr Waterhouse's Defence

Boston 3^d February 1812

To the Hon^{ble} and Reverend
the President & Fellows of Harvard College
Gentlemen!

When I had the satisfaction of appearing before you on the 11th of Nov^r. I represented to you, that as my accusers had been allowed four weeks to prepare themselves, after they had presented their complaints, it was just and reasonable that I should have as much time to prepare my defence; especially as they were five persons combined against one. I represented further, that notwithstanding this attack was made suddenly upon me, in the midst of my course of Lectures, I should not neglect, or slight my official duties to defend myself; but that I was determined to go steadily through my course without allowing my attention to be divided, or my mind to be called off, by searching for papers, or looking up evidence, and that therefore I begged leave to postpone every thing of the kind, till a week or two after our present course of Lectures was finished.

Although this was protested against by Dr^r Warren, & opposed almost as violently by Dr^r Jackson, it was thought just and reasonable by the whole Corporation. On enquiring when the Lectures would finish the Corporation were told by the Prof^r of Anatomy to whom I referred, that they would probably finish, the second week in January. On the suggestion of the Hon. Judge Davis the last Saturday in Jan^r was fixed upon for us to meet again in this place. This arrangement was perfectly agreeable to me, and I withdrew from the Corporation satisfied with the conference. —

It was distinctly announced, & clearly understood, by me, & by others, that the Lectures would finish about the 15th of the month (Jan^r), which would have allowed me ten days for preparation (to 25th), and I made all my arrangements accordingly. But what will the Corporation think when they are informed that on Monday the 13th it was announced to the pupils - "that the Professors of Harvard University had agreed to extend their respective courses to a longer period than usual, to the number it was understood of 15 Lectures"; and this without giving the Professor of Theory and Practice of Physic the least intimation of their design. - These gentlemen had prepared accordingly, while I, being kept in ignorance of their design, was, in a manner, unprepared. I therefore found myself 3 weeks ago in the unpleasant situation of either appearing slack in my duty, and behaving my colleagues in exertion, and therefore a "Dunce in the Hive", or that I must exert myself day and night to keep pace with the rest. - I chose the latter.

I told the President that I did not know but that I might between Friday & Monday of every week, find a little time to attend to this business. But it so happened in consequence of an alarm of small-pox, that I was obliged to go, on those days, every week in succession to Salem and Marblehead, & this compelled me to give sometimes two Lectures in one day. I never had a greater weight on my mind, but I had hope, health & good spirits, sufficient to get through my embarrassments; but not a moment's time for the preparation contemplated.

I had said to the Corporation, & in the hearing

of all the professors but one (D^r Dexter), that I should not attempt to put any thing to paper by way of repelling these charges till after I had closed my lectures, & when I received the President's letter dated 31st Jan^r appointing this meeting the the Lectures were not over. —

The antecedent & subsequent conduct of my accusers, these old & young professors, induce me to believe, & justify me in saying that my embarrassment & perplexity was the object aimed at. But they did not stop here. It had never been the custom, nor had I the least intention of closing my course with a public Lecture that is an occasional lecture. —

What then was my surprise on reading in the Palladium of last Friday, an advertisement notifying that the Lectures of Harvard University would finish the next day, & that the closing ones would be public. Here I saw that my Lecture room might be crowded the next day, (as was the case) with people, in expectation of a public occasional lecture, where I had never prepared for one, as it had never been usual. —

At that moment I received your letter Mr President, notifying me of this days meeting. Had each and every one of these gentlemen chosen to give a public Lecture, & so advertised it, no one would have called the propriety of it in question, but to make it thus general was to include me in a public performance without any previous intimation, & for which I was by no means prepared.

At the close of my Lecture on Friday, I read to my pupils this advertisement, & after telling them that I had no intention of giving a public lecture, and saying

what I thought was proper on the occasion, I told them, that
as there was three or twenty hours between then & the usual
hour of lecturing the next day I would give a public
lecture & that they might bring in whom they pleased
to it. — I accordingly gave the public Lecture to
perhaps an hundred people; and a respectable number of
them have asked for a copy of it for the press. If it is
printed I shall relate the circumstances under which
it was written. All these being considered, you will, at
once, see that I could have neither time nor disposition
for preparing any thing by way of defence before you.

And accordingly I have never looked at a single paper,
nor committed any thing to writing, or taken a single
step in the business. —

It was my own opinion, & the advice of
some respectable friends, that I ought first to acquaint
the Corporation with these things, that if they thought
fit, they might be enquired into, & not mixed with matters
antecedent to this period. As I knew nothing in the
institution could suffer by the delay of a week or two,
I have followed the dictate of my own judgement & the
advice of my friends, and I hope I shall not be blamed
by the Corporation. If I am under a wrong impression, that
impression had better be removed now, than carried along with what
I meant to commit to paper. — If what I have related was
not meant to perplex and embarrass, & injure me, and can be
respectably explained away, it had better be done now than
mixed in with any old matter. —